

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY



3 1761 03324 0391

CONSTITUTIONAL LAW
Cases and Materials
Volume IV

Dick Risk, Carol Rogerson, Lorraine Weinrib and Patrick Macklem

Faculty of Law
University of Toronto

1991-92

45-724-221

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY

JAN 7 1992

FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

CONSTITUTIONAL LAW
Cases and Materials
Volume IV

Dick Risk, Carol Rogerson, Lorraine Weinrib and Patrick Macklem

Faculty of Law
University of Toronto

1991-92



Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2019 with funding from
University of Toronto

CONSTITUTIONAL LAW

Table of Contents

Volume IV

PAGE

V. THE CHARTER OF RIGHTS AND FREEDOMS

Russell, "The Political Purposes of the Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms".....	1
1. <u>Principles of Interpretation</u>	
<u>Law Society of Upper Canada v. Skapinker</u>	15
<u>Hunter v. Southam</u>	18
<u>R. v. Big M Drug Mart</u>	20
<u>Reference Re Section 94(2) of the Motor Vehicle Act (B.C.)</u>	44
<u>Reference Re Public Service Employee Relations Act (Alta.)</u>	47
Note: Continued Relevance of the Bill of Rights	49
<u>R. v. Therens</u>	49
2. <u>Section One</u>	
i) <u>International Comparisons</u>	
ii) <u>Legislative History</u>	
Bayefsky, "Defining Equality Rights"	52
Draft of Proposed Charter, July 1980	55
iii) <u>Reasonable Limits</u>	
<u>Re Singh and Minister of Employment and Immigration</u>	58
<u>R. v. Oakes</u>	62
<u>Edwards Books and Art Ltd. v. The Queen</u>	66
<u>Edmonton Journal v. Attorney-General for Alberta</u>	85
iv) <u>Prescribed by Law</u>	
Note: <u>Sunday Times v. United Kingdom</u>	89
<u>Re Ontario Film and Video Appreciation Society & Ontario Board of Censors</u>	89
<u>R. v. Therens</u>	93
Note: <u>R. v. Robson</u> ; <u>Re Luscher</u>	94
<u>A.-G. of Quebec v. Irwin Toy</u>	95
Note	97

3. The Override

Weiler, "The Evolution of the Charter: A View from the Outside"	98
Federal-Provincial First Ministers' Conference, "Fact Sheet"	101
Ontario Human Rights Code, s. 46	101
Canadian Bill of Rights, ss. 1, 2	102
Mandel, <u>The Charter of Rights and the Legalization of Politics in Canada</u>	103
<u>Alliance des Professeurs de Montreal v. A.-G. Quebec</u>	106
<u>Ford v. A.-G. Quebec</u>	112
Whyte, "On Not Standing for Notwithstanding"	118
Weinrib, "Learning to Live with the Override"	122

4. Application

i) <u>The Debate About Application to Private Action</u>	
<u>Retail, Wholesale & Department Store Union, Local 580 v. Dolphin Delivery Ltd.</u>	129
ii) <u>Post Dolphin Delivery: Finding Governmental Action</u>	
Note	138
Swinton, "Application of the Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms"	140
<u>McKinney v. University of Guelph</u>	142
Note: <u>Harrison v. U.B.C.; Stoffman v. Vancouver General Hospital; Douglas/Kwantlen Faculty Assn. v. Douglas College</u>	153
<u>Lavigne v. Ontario Public Service Employees Union</u>	154

5. Remedies

i) <u>Declaration of Invalidity; Prospective Invalidation</u>	
Gibson, <u>The Law of the Charter: General Principles</u>	159
<u>Reference Re Language Rights Under the Manitoba Act, 1870</u>	162
<u>Re Dixon and Attorney-General of B.C.</u>	171
Note: <u>R. v. Swain</u>	175

ii) Reading Down; Constitutional Exemptions

Rogerson, "The Judicial Search for Appropriate Remedies under the Charter: The Examples of Overbreadth and Vagueness".....	176
Gibson, <u>The Law of the Charter:</u>	
<u>General Principles</u>	181
Note: Constitutional Exemptions	183
<u>R. v. Chief</u>	184
Note: <u>Osborne v. Canada (Treasury Board);</u>	
<u>R. v. Seaboyer; R. v. Gayme</u>	189

iii) Underinclusive Laws: Invalidation or Extension?

Note	192
Gibson, <u>The Law of the Charter:</u>	
<u>General Principles</u>	193

iv) Structural Injunctions

<u>Swann v. Charlotte Mecklenburg Board of Educ.</u>	195
Sharpe, "Injunctions and the Charter"	199
Note	202
<u>Marchand v. Simcoe County Board of Educ.</u>	203

6. Freedom of Religion and Conscience

<u>International Comparisons</u>	
James, <u>The Varieties of Religious Experience</u>	207
<u>R. v. Videoflicks</u>	208
Miscellaneous Newspaper Clippings	209
<u>Re Regional Municipality of Peel et al.</u>	
<u>and Great Atlantic and Pacific Co.</u>	
<u>of Canada Ltd.</u>	215
<u>Zylberberg v. Director of Sudbury Board</u>	
<u>of Education</u>	222
Re: <u>Corporation of the Canadian Civil</u>	
<u>Liberties Association and Minister</u>	
<u>of Education</u>	237
<u>Reference Re an Act to Amend the Education</u>	
<u>Act (Ontario)</u>	248

7. Freedom of Expression

i) <u>International Comparisons</u>	253
ii) <u>Purposes of the Guarantee</u>	255
iii) <u>What is "Expression"?</u>	258
<u>Retail, Wholesale, and Dept. Store Union,</u>	
<u>Local 580 v. Dolphin Delivery Ltd.</u>	258

<u>Ford v. A.G. Quebec</u>	261
<u>A.G. Quebec v. Irwin Toy Ltd.</u>	270
Hutchinson, "Money Talk: Against Constitutionalizing (Commercial) Speech"	291
Sharpe, "A Comment on Allan Hutchinson's 'Money Talk'"	296
<u>Royal College of Dental Surgeons of Ontario v. Rocket</u>	301

iv) Freedom of Expression and the Political Process

<u>National Citizens Coalition Inc. v. A.G. for Canada</u>	306
Richards, "The Equalization of Power and Free Speech" from <u>Toleration and the Constitution</u>	315
<u>Re MacKay et al. and the Government of Manitoba</u>	318
Note: <u>Osborne v. Canada Treasury Board</u>	324
Note: <u>Reference re Electoral Boundaries Commission</u>	327

v) Hate Literature

<u>R. v. Keegstra</u>	332
Note: <u>Taylor v. Canadian Human Rights Commission</u>	376
Globe and Mail, March 23, 1989	377
Saskatchewan Human Rights Code, s. 14	378
Manitoba Human Rights Code, s. 18	378
Law Reform Commission of Canada, <u>Hate Propaganda</u>	379
Richards, "Group Libel and Offense in the Public Forum" from <u>Toleration and the Constitution</u>	382
Globe and Mail, "Jewish Congress urges Stratford to ban youngsters from Shylock play"	385
<u>Reconstruction</u> , "The Problem of Offensive Speech on Campus"	386
New York Times, "Free Speech and Insults on Campus"	387

vi) Obscenity and Pornography

Note	389
<u>Criminal Code</u> s. 63	390
Note	391
Bill C-54	392
<u>Theatres Act</u> (Ont.)	395
MacKinnon, "Not a Moral Issue"	399
Model Antipornography Law	404

Richards, "Pornography Commissions and the First Amendment"	405
West, "The Feminist-Conservative Anti- Pornography Alliance and the 1986 A.G.'s Commission on Pornography Report"	411
Note: <u>Ontario Film and Video Appreciation Society v. Ontario Board of Censors</u>	421
Note: <u>Re Luscher</u>	422
Note: <u>Information Retailers of Metropolitan Toronto v. Municipality of Metropolitan Toronto</u>	423
<u>R. v. Butler</u>	424
vii) <u>Prostitution</u>	
<u>Reference re ss. 193 and 195(1)(a) of the Criminal Code</u>	440
Freeman, "The Feminist Debate over Prostitution Reform"	458

